OHIO
Project:
COVID-19 Data Sharing

Background

- COVID-19 has many local WF professionals trying to prepare and plan for an economy and workforce post-COVID-19, including employers needing workers, understanding which employers aren't re-opening, and strategizing how to help impacted workers.
- From the WF Directors association, we have heard the need for data that would assist them locally as they work with their local stakeholders to prepare for what's next. Without data, the work isn't focused and with limited resources, this must be focused.
- OWD is receiving data and information requests from all areas of the state as well as all stakeholders all trying to get access to similar data. However, they aren't sure who to send it to, so we got a shot gun approach with one request being sent to multiple people and or multiple requests for same data from multiple stakeholders. Either way, this must be cleaned up.
- Requests are also coming in asking for data with the belief that this data will assist in answering the question/issue they are trying to respond/solve, but in reality, a different set of data would be better if those processing the request had a better sense of what question/issue the stakeholder trying to solve.
- Not every local county has the capacity to take data and perform analysis on it. This will require others to try and put together data in a way that will be of value for those that have no research staff and be available to locals who will want to take the data and analyze it further.

Goal/Objective Statements

- Host information in one location
    - Ensure stakeholders know what data is available
    - Streamline/simplify process for data request submittals
        - Assistance with understanding of issue and ensure the right data is being used/sent to address the issue appropriately
    - Access to public data without request
- Prepare level of analysis on the data to be of value to areas without capacity

Recommended Strategy/Solutions

AI-1: Select and develop location for information
The majority of workforce professionals and researchers rely on the Bureau Labor Market Information (LMI) for their data needs. With this in mind, it was determined that the most effective place to house the dedicated COVID-19 data was a "special" landing page within the LMI website. Minor enhancements will need to be made to existing site in order to meet the recommended solutions identified in this plan.

AI-2: Ensure stakeholders know what data is available

It is proposed that the landing page contain a brief introduction page explaining the following:

- The type of data sets currently available with or without a data sharing agreement
- Links to those data sets currently available – public access
  - The links would contain a brief description, so the customer has a better understanding prior to their selection. Here is an example for the County Economic Profile report:
    - "The County Economic Profile report provides a trend or snapshot view of key economic indicators at the county level. Information includes employment and job posting trends, industry turnover rates, high school enrollment, local area talent, educational attainment, veteran employment estimates, civilian labor force estimates and commuting patterns, area population to jobs ratios and a profile of unemployment insurance claims. The most recent report contains indicators for calendar year 2019 and earlier. As most data in the report lag current economic events it provides useful metrics for economic conditions preceding measures to contain the spread of COVID-19. This report provides baseline data or supplemental information to recent/post-COVID-19 monthly and quarterly reports."
- Process to request a data sharing agreement
- Process/form to complete in order to request COVID-19 related data

AI-3: Streamline/simplify process for data request submittals

To ensure that staff can better respond to requests in a timely manner, a form has been developed to assist the customer with the request process. The form is designed to have the customer detail the issue they are trying to solve. This information will assist staff with ensuring the proper data is shared/used with the customer. A draft form is attached in Figure 1: COVID-19 Data Request Form.

AI-4 Access to public data without request

<u>**AI-4A** County Economic Profile</u>

The 2nd annual County Economic Profile report is scheduled to be released July 6th, 2020. OWD launched this report for the first-time last year in July. It was well received, and it also came with an instructional guide that explained for each data set/report: "What it means"; "How to interpret", and "Questions" the report could address. Each county gets their own custom report that contains the following sections:

- Employment % by Industry
- Employment trends
- Online job postings
- Industry turnover rates
- High School enrollments
- Local area talent
- Educational attainment

- Veteran employment
- Civilian labor force and commuting patterns
- Area population to jobs
- Profile of UI claims

The team is hopeful with the locals having had a year of this report, that the team will get feedback on additional data sets/reports that can be added to help address future programs to be implemented locally.

AI-4B COVID-19 Job Trends (prior & current)
Also scheduled to be released in early July will be a COVID-19 job trend report by county. This report will:
- Graph a snapshot at specific time intervals of the number electronic job openings prior to the "Ohio stay at home order" through the end of May
- Will show over a period of time the number of job ads, new ads and the percent change for:
  - Top employers
  - Top occupations
  - Breakdown by Industry

A draft review of this report is attached, labeled Figure 2: COVID-19 Job Trends Report.

AI-5: COVID-19 Trend comparison by Employer by UI Claimants
OWD staff are currently taking the weekly UI claimant file and trying to crossmatch this with the employer file to potentially show a trend by local employers. We plan to track unemployment claims by employer for the week of the "stay at home order" and at four and eight weeks after the order. This will give a picture of the number of employees who were filing for unemployment benefits from this local employer at three different time periods. Each county will need to set their own review and recommendation based upon this data. Assumptions, questions and local considerations will need to be made, such as:
- If the trend shows continued or increasing filing among, is the employer still operational or is it shutting down?
- If trend is reversing and there are fewer filings by employees, is the employer resuming operations?
- If the trend in filing claims is flat, does this mean employer closing doors for good or is it waiting to reopen operations, possibly because workers not wish to return either because of health concerns or because they get more on unemployment?

This trend comparison is complicated and requires effort by OWD staff to join different data sets to develop this comparison. It is currently slated for late summer for county release if the current analysis and crossmatching process is successful. It should be noted that this data for large employers that have multiple establishments through Ohio (like Amazon, Kroger, etc) can only be matched to the headquartered employer and not by site location.

AI-6: COVID-19 UI Claimant data
Currently OWD staff have been sharing weekly UI Claimant data with those Workforce Areas that have an interest in receiving the data for outreach purposes. The following table demonstrates the status by Workforce Areas regarding the weekly UI Claimant data:

Currently accepting UI Claimant data	Not receiving UI Claimant data
3 4 5 9 10 11 12 14 15 16 18 19 20	1 2 6 7 8 13 17

Even though we are currently sharing this data, this particular data set is massive and could be overwhelming to, one just to receive, but two, receive weekly updates.   For this reason, this initiative would be a good topic first topic for the workgroup being formed to discuss what analysis could the State do with the data to add value for all Workforce Areas. The following example is one brought to us from a local workforce area, that this data could already answer (however we realize that AI-5 could shed more light regarding possible call back as well from a trending standpoint):
- Review of occupations of current individuals filing to see if a better match for current openings in other industries, knowing that possible WIOA training may be necessary to support transition to other skills. Example: Cleaning staff from Hotel industry to openings in Healthcare for cleaning

The following is a list of the current data fields accessible in the file:
- City
- County
- UC Claimant ID
- CCMEP eligible (i.e., is the claimant 24 years old or under)
- First Name
- Last Name
- Email Address
- Phone Number
- Lay-off date
- Separating Position
- 2 O*NET Codes of desired positions
- Mailing address (added week of June 15th)

We have submitted request to receive and distribute PUA data, this is still outstanding.

AI-7: Communication Plan regarding the announcement of COVID-19 Data Website
A communication plan will be developed with OComm and OWD to ensure best outreach and understanding of the COVID-19 data currently available to workforce professionals and interested stakeholders. Part of this plan will include:
- A webinar with our local Workforce Professionals
- A recorded tutorial that can be accessed on the website for first time users (self-training module)
- A user guide for each data set currently available
- Ability to become part of "listserv" to receive updates when data has been made available

AI-8: Create Workforce Data Workgroup

A Workforce Data Workgroup of staff from both associations and champion stakeholders would get together on a monthly basis to "check-in" on topics, such as:

- Feedback on current COVID-19 data available
- Brainstorm discussions on other possible data sets that may be available
- Discussion on possible analysis State can do with existing data and post to website. This is based on the assumption that most local counties will not have staff/capacity to do analysis on some of the data available.

The outcome from these monthly workgroup meetings will be posted to the LMI website and sent to the listserv so everyone will be informed of possible new data sets or analysis coming in the near future.

Implementation Timeline

The following is a very high-level timeline regarding the above strategies:

Action Item #	Recommended Strategy/Solutions and tasks	Estimated Completion Date
AI-1	**Select and develop location for information**	7/3/2020
	• Prep language for new landing page	
	• Create sub-landing pages with corresponding language	
	• OComm approval on content/language	
AI-2	**Ensure stakeholders know what data is available**	7/3/2020
	• Prep language for all data sets made available on website	
	• OComm approval on content/language	
A1-3	**Streamline/simplify process for data request submittals**	7/3/2020
	• Finalize and develop form (web of fillable pdf)	
	• Establish protocols for internal review and outgoing message on request (can, cannot, pending, and timeframe to receiving data)	
AI-4A	**Access to public data without request** **County Economic Profile Report**	7/6/2020
	• Finalize data analysis	
	• Compile individual county reports	
	• Review and approve county reports	
	• Load reports to website/test	
AI-4B	**Access to public data without request** **COVID-19 Job Trends**	7/6/2020
	• Finalize data analysis	
	• Compile individual county reports	
	• Review and approve county reports	

	• Load reports to website/test	
AI-5	**COVID-19 Trend comparison by Employer by UI Claimants**	9/14/2020
	• Finalize data analysis/crossmatch	
	• Compile individual county reports	
	• Review and approve county reports	
	• Send reports to each county (Assumes Legal approval)	
AI-6	**COVID-19 UI Claimant data**	On-going
AI-7	**Communication Plan regarding the announcement of COVID-19 Data Website**	6/22/2020
	• Develop draft plan for review	
	• OComm approval	
	• Review with Data Workgroup	
AI-8	**Create Workforce Data Workgroup**	6/15/2020
	• Solicit members from Associations and interested stakeholders	
	• Create draft agenda for first meeting	
	• Establish future monthly meetings (day/time)	

Outstanding issues/Risks to Implement

(1) Currently Office of Legal has not granted permission to allow the release of the employer data as part of "AI-5: COVID-19 Trend comparison by employer by UI Claimant." We continue to work with Legal to explore the sharing of this information and possible enhancements to the existing data sharing agreements with local Workforce Areas.
(2) Review current presentation of existing reports to see if a different format would be easier to use, such as creating reports in excel versus PDF.

Misc notes/comments

N/A at this time

Figure 1: COVID-19 Data Request Form
DRAFT

To help us accommodate information and data requests during the pandemic, the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services is asking that you complete this form. This form will help us track requests and direct them to the appropriate information/data owners.

Contact Information

Name:

Email address:

Phone:

Organization/Agency:

Question or information needed:

    a. What question(s) do you want to answer using this information or data? How do you plan to use this information?

    b. What are the geographic areas that you would like data for? (For example, the State of Ohio, the JobsOhio Central Region, Cuyahoga County, Toledo, etc.)

    c. Do you want data for any specific population demographic characteristics? (For example, age groups, sex, race/ethnicity, employment status, etc.)

    d. What time period is preferred? (For example, most recent data available, annually from 2010 to most recent, monthly from January 2018 to most recent, etc.)

Date needed:

Is this request related to a past request?

Do you currently have a data sharing agreement with ODJFS?

Figure 2: COVID-19 Job Trends Report
DRAFT

Online Job Postings - COVID-19 Impact
State of Ohio
Updated 5/5/2020

A total of 106,805 job openings were posted online from April 26, 2020, through May 2, 2020, for the state of Ohio. This represents a 31.5% decrease when compared to the total number of job ads for the week prior to the Ohio Stay at Home Order (March 15, 2020 - March 21, 2020). Among all job openings posted online from April 26, 2020, through May 2, 2020, 11,655 (8.2%) represent new job ads. The graph below shows historical trends for both available and new ads posted over the last several weeks.

Top Employers with the Most Area Job Ads

Employer	Total Ads¹	New Ads²	% Change Total Ads³
The Dollar General	4,365	6	-1.7%
Cleveland Clinic	2,609	179	-29.2%
Amazon	2,372	697	801.5%
Language Line Solutions	2,349	0	-0.1%
Oracle	1,664	40	-48.6%
Lowe's	1,437	261	-14.8%
Bon Secours Health System	1,415	34	-32.1%
Children'S Hospital Medical Center	1,290	11	-63.9%
McDonald's Corporation	1,222	44	-19.7%
AutoZone, Inc	1,113	0	0.1%
CVS Health	1,062	32	-3.2%
Pizza Hut	949	0	-3.0%
Domino's Pizza	925	0	-0.6%
Walmart	914	2	1657.7%
University of Cincinnati	823	15	-3.2%
True North Energy	814	3	-1.2%
Home Depot	710	33	-1.6%
TriHealth	619	57	-57.3%
Advance Auto Parts, Inc.	587	25	-6.6%
Dollar Tree Stores, Inc.	585	47	-16.2%
Kroger	561	191	-2.6%
Circle K	549	4	-2.0%
Speedway	530	0	-4.2%
Nationwide Children's Hospital	509	57	-53.3%
Promedica	506	36	-34.7%
Starbucks	502	0	0.0%
Carrols Restaurant Group	483	33	-45.2%
Family Dollar	467	7	37.0%
Roehl Transport, Inc.	419	103	-2.1%
Army	418	100	-6.3%
Columbus City Schools	413	1	0.0%
KeyBank	411	46	-23.1%
Pacific Bells, Inc.	397	0	0.0%
Briti Medical Search	363	91	125.9%
US Census Bureau	359	4	13.2%
Huntington National Bank	352	32	-13.8%
Giant Eagle	348	56	1236.5%
Anthem, Inc.	343	5	-55.4%
Olive Garden	329	0	-5.9%
National Church Residences	327	20	-15.7%
Meijer	320	21	-26.4%
CommuniCare Health Services	320	151	2609.1%
Veterans Health Administration	311	27	20.2%
JPMorgan Chase & Co.	310	55	-61.4%
Fifth Third Bank	309	14	-27.1%
HCR ManorCare	307	102	12.7%
Deloitte	306	41	-70.0%
Securitas	303	0	-21.3%
Autman Health Foundation	297	19	-20.4%
Greater Cincinnati School Application Consortia	296	12	0.7%

Top Occupations with the Most Area Job Ads

Occupation	Total Ads¹	New Ads²	% Change Total Ads³
First-Line Supervisors of Retail Sales Workers	7,065	207	-9.7%
Registered Nurses	6,225	437	-44.5%
Retail Salespersons	4,789	290	-26.1%
Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers	3,036	209	-27.2%
Customer Service Representatives	2,617	125	-28.9%
Interpreters and Translators	2,395	2	-0.9%
First-Line Supervisors of Food Preparation and Serving	2,193	55	-22.6%
Cashiers	1,925	244	-19.7%
Stock Clerks- Stockroom, Warehouse, or Storage Yard	1,926	252	25.4%
Software Developers, Applications	1,894	207	-25.8%
Combined Food Prep and Serving, Including Fast Food	1,814	47	-25.5%
Nursing Assistants	1,702	250	-17.3%
Stock Clerks, Sales Floor	1,221	228	-14.3%
Laborers & Freight, Stock, &Material Movers, Hand	1,182	223	89.1%
Maintenance and Repair Workers, General	1,161	130	-35.3%
Licensed Practical and Licensed Vocational Nurses	1,132	152	-14.0%
Sales Reps, Wholesale & Mfg, Tech & Scientific	1,057	75	-33.2%
1st-Line Supervs of Office and Admin Support Workers	1,047	71	-26.8%
Light Truck or Delivery Services Drivers	1,039	55	-17.2%
Sales Representatives, Services, All Other	956	67	-50.6%
Physicians and Surgeons, All Other	949	43	5.1%
Driver/Sales Workers	896	52	-2.6%
Sales Reps, Wholesale & Mfg, Except Tech & Scientific	857	43	-35.6%
Personal Care Aides	832	69	-3.4%
Janitors & Cleaners, Except Maids and Housekeeping	813	94	-23.6%
Security Guards	810	104	-27.1%
Pharmacy Technicians	795	29	-15.2%
1st-Line Supervs of Production & Operating Workers	793	81	-22.9%
Medical and Health Services Managers	779	59	-35.4%
General and Operations Managers	762	59	-22.4%
Sales Managers	760	77	-29.6%
Food Service Managers	727	18	-19.2%
First-Line Supervisors of Non-Retail Sales Workers	716	42	-26.9%
Management Analysts	695	107	-52.7%
Merchandise Displayers and Window Trimmers	694	128	-22.2%
Industrial Engineers	668	59	-45.3%
Production Workers, All Other	630	56	-5.3%
Accountants	629	56	-41.2%
Cooks, Restaurant	626	19	-28.6%
Network and Computer Systems Administrators	620	96	-22.6%
Marketing Managers	617	99	-56.0%
Information Security Analysts	614	121	-25.2%
Computer Systems Engineers/Architects	607	96	-27.0%
1st-Line Supervs of Trans. & Material-Moving Machine	596	53	-24.2%
Computer Systems Analysts	596	62	-47.1%
Computer User Support Specialists	584	55	-51.4%
Insurance Sales Agents	577	39	-19.5%
Family and General Practitioners	574	14	8.3%
Social and Human Service Assistants	553	67	-20.6%
Food Preparation Workers	549	26	-19.0%

Area Job Ads by Industry

Industry	Total Ads¹	New Ads²	% Change Total Ads³
Retail Trade	18,942	1290	-14.5%
Health Care and Social Assistance	16,463	1146	-27.3%
Accommodation and Food Services	8,062	200	-30.1%
Manufacturing	5,526	600	-45.9%
Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services	5,210	565	-41.6%
Admin., Support, Waste & Remediation	4,267	364	-16.3%
Finance and Insurance	3,642	291	-36.1%
Wholesale Trade	2,657	369	-43.6%
Transportation and Warehousing	1,959	262	-29.6%
Educational Services	1,904	72	-29.3%

Industry	Total Ads¹	New Ads²	% Change Total Ads³
Other Services (except Public Administration)	1,585	141	-45.6%
Real Estate and Rental and Leasing	1,544	193	-39.6%
Public Administration	1,453	217	-27.2%
Construction	1,272	90	-24.6%
Information	1,271	156	-44.5%
Arts, Entertainment, and Recreation	432	16	-39.5%
Management of Companies and Enterprises	160	22	-34.3%
Utilities	119	13	-56.5%
Agriculture, Forestry, Fishing and Hunting	71	7	-22.8%
Mining, Quarrying, and Oil and Gas Extraction	66	4	-45.0%